Open Letter to Colorado Commission on Affordable Health Care (CCAHC)

by George Swan, MPH Iplus007@gmail.com 303-406-8009

Cc: Governor John Hickenlooper

Senator Jim Smallwood Representative Joann Ginal Representative Jonathan Singer

Center for Improvement in Value of Health Care (CIVHC)

Colorado Health Institute (CHI)

Senator John Kefalas

After three years of devoted effort by the Commissioners, the <u>Final Report from CCAHC to the legislators of Colorado</u> has been submitted (30 Jun, 2017). In their Summary, they identify a "need for significant data analytics (pg66)." Of the many aspects of data transparency listed (see excerpt below), the greatest opportunity for data transparency will be development of <u>a comprehensive data portal</u>.

In 2010, House Bill 10-1330 provided for implementation of an All-Payer-Claims-Database (APCD). Furthermore, there is an explicit requirement of the Bill to implement <u>a comprehensive data portal</u> containing data above and beyond just claims data. Moreover, in December 2010, the <u>Data and Transparency Advisory Group</u> submitted clear expectations of this obligation to the CIVHC Advisory Board.

Numerous examples of publicly-available data sets have been submitted to the <u>"public input" folder at the CCAHC website</u>. They illustrate how much data is already available, yet they exist in silos. Bringing these data sets together (i.e., from Public Health, Medicare, Medicaid, CDC etc.) can enable potentially informative and invaluable insights.

The framework of <u>Triple Aim</u> (improved population health, improved patient care and more affordable health care) has been widely adopted across the healthcare industry. A comprehensive data portal will include relevant <u>key metrics</u>, as delineated by the Institute for Healthcare Improvement (IHI, with granularity at least to the county level. See "<u>Healthy Colorado: Plan 2015-2019</u>".

A timely "Colorado Health Expenditures" report is another essential element of this data portal, following the methodology of the <u>Statewide Health Expenditures</u> and <u>National Health Expenditures</u>, as provided by CMS. See the NHE report below.

Lastly, the Final Report rightfully underlines the importance of Social Determinants of Health (see below). Community Health Assessments by local county public health officials should include their Health Equity profile from the <u>County Health Rankings</u>. See the example of Denver County.

With the assistance of CIVHC collaborators and stakeholders, there is sufficient guidance available in HB10-1330 to move forward rapidly and inexpensively to implement this data portal, not only to serve the consumers and stakeholders of Colorado, but as a demonstration of leadership to the rest of the country to help ensure the quality of health care our citizens have a right to expect.

Sincerely/ George Swan, MPH

Transparency (2016 Report, p.18 and 2017 Report, p.47)



- Support consumers making informed choices by compiling and reporting existing price, quality, and clinical outcome metrics on publicly-facing website(s).
 - Ensure that the website(s) provides various tiers of timely information based on different consumers' understanding of price and quality data.
 - Ensure the results of the pilot are published after two years to demonstrate usage, changes in behavior, and savings. This pilot would provide proof of concept for the commercial market.
- Create a state employee pilot using transparency tools to inform employees of the state of cost and quality metrics related to specific elective procedures.
- Promote more transparent and publicly available data with a focus primarily on facilities, pharmaceuticals, and providers' prices.
- Data that is made available for consumers and providers should be timely, accessible, consumer-friendly, actionable, and regularly updated.
- Support a statewide total cost of care initiative (payments) to get an understanding of costs relative to other states.
- Explore the potential for financial incentives to motivate consumers to use decision aids.
- Analysis is necessary to understand and make more transparent the main contributors to overhead costs (e.g., administrative and capital costs for all relevant providers) that affect the cost of providing care to Medicaid enrollees.
- The legislature should authorize funds to analyze and identify potential opportunities/recommendations to reduce overhead costs (or incent lower overhead costs) associated with all providers.

Social Determinants of Health (2016 Report, p.37 and 2017 Report, p.50)



- Reduce silos within state agencies so Medicaid patients can receive the support needed to address their specific needs or condition (e.g. housing, job training, and/or placement)
- Adopt payment structures in Medicaid, such as braided or bundled funding, that address clients' social determinants of health.
 - More meaningfully align state agencies on health and health care potentially through a single Health Authority with purview over all health insurance, Medicaid, and public health
 - Pilot braided funding models for high utilizers for housing (Massachusetts showed savings)
 - Expand Medicaid ACC medical home model to braid in funding for social services, including supportive housing and employment
- Create a pilot to identify urban, low-income patients with asthma from ZIP codes with high Emergency Department (ED) visits or hospitalizations due to asthma and offer enhanced care including case management and home visits.
- Provide financial support to measure the actuarial return on investment for public health.
- Provide access to quality preschool for Medicaid children.
- Develop a statewide screening, referral, care coordination strategy and infrastructure, and a statewide navigation system to connect

CMS Health Expenditures by State 2017R

Colorado Commission on Affordable Health Care Pivot Table: NHE Historical and Projected to 2020

Altarum CSHS: Health Sector Economic Indicator Briefs 2017 Region_Name (All) Health Affairs: Health Spending by State thru 2014 Colorado State_Name 6,370 6,612 6,892 7,094 7,292 7,535 7,703 8.045 4.2% 4.4% USA, Avg \$ per Enrollee >> 3.8% 2.2% 2.9% 3,39 of Y2007 of Y2008 of Y2009 of Y2010 of Y2011 of Y2012 of Y2013 of Y2014 Y2008 Y2009 Y2010 Y2011 Y2012 Y2013 Y2014 Code Description Type Exp \$ Per Enroll 1 Personal Health Care 5,522 5.685 5.882 5,979 6.129 6.306 6.472 6,804 3.0 Hospital Care 1.952 2.049 2.209 2.326 2.36 2,439 2,600 2.739 5.09 7.89 5.3% 1.69 3.29 6.6% 5.39 Physician & ClinCare 1,449 1,481 1,468 1,523 1.99 1,476 1,509 1,516 1,602 0.39 -0.9% 2.89 0.99 -0.5% Other Prof Servio 219 236 27. 8.3 0.49 5.19 36 386 387 409 413 419 3.09 3.5% Dental Services 375 39 -0.3% 1.89 3.69 1.59 6 Home Health Care 127 129 141 152 162 173 181 192 1.69 9.39 7.8% 6.89 4.68 61% Rx Drugs and NonDurMed 695668 641 599 601 611 605 681 -3.99 -4.096-6.6%0.39 1.79 -1.0%12.69 159 163 Durable Medical Prod 150 150 147 151 167 172 0.09 -2.0% 2.7% 3.09 4.29 2.29 Nursing Home Care 6.59 5.5% 3.5% 1.1% 0.59 10 261 296 323 290 4.69 Other Healthcare 277 292 300 304 6.19 6.99 -1.4% 2.79 7.79 -5.9% Enrolle 11 Population (k) 4.804 4.890 4,972 5.049 5.118 5,190 5,268 5,350 1.8% 1.7% 1.5% 1.49 1.4% 1.5% 1.6% Total Exp (\$m) 26.529 1 Hospital Care 9,377 10,018 10,984 11,743 12,657 13,694 14,650 6.89 9.69 4.69 7.05 7,907 7.987 3 Physician & ClinCare 6.959 7.218 7.364 7,409 7,721 8,572 3.79 2.0% 0.6% 429 2,49 1.0% Δ Other Prof Services 1.049 1.152 1.168 1.253 1.390 1.489 1.601 1.739 9.89 1.49 7.3% 10.99 6.89 7.9% 8.69 5 Dental Services 1.750 1.836 1.929 1.953 2.014 2.119 2.174 2,239 4.99 5.19 1.2% 3.19 5.2% 2.6% 3.09 Home Health Care 603 631 3,69 10.89 8.19 83 1,026 8.19 Rx Drugs and NonDurM 3,339 3,264 3,189 3,026 3,074 3,172 3,187 3,642 -2.29 -2.39 -5.1% 14.39 Durable Medical Prod 1.99 4,4% 3.9% 7Ľ 762 81 -0.49 6.69 4.39 4.45 9 Nursing Home Care 1.469 1.592 1.710 1.798 1.898 1.969 2.015 2,058 8.49 7.49 5.1% 5.69 3.7% 2.3% 2.19 Other Healthcare 10 1.255 1.354 1.473 1.475 1.537 1.674 1.601 1.552 7.9% 8.8% 0.1% 4.29 8.9% 4.4% -3.19 aid \$ Per Enrollee ersonal Health Care 6.1% 6,886 7,109 6,972 7,178 7,104 7,535 7,995 7,143 3.29 -1.9% 3.0% -1.09 6.1% -10.79 Hospital Care 2,455 2,558 2,455 3,031 3,013 3,240 3,431 2,910 429 -4.0% -0.69 7.59 5,9% -15.29 23.5% Physician & ClinCare 910 892 966 870 911 969 1.169 1.273 -2.09 8.39 -9.9% 4.79 6.3% 20.8% 8.9 4 Other Prof Services 0 HDIV/0 HDIV/O IDIV/0! #DIV/0 (DIV/O #DIV/0! #DIV/0 Dental Services 16 178 214 211 212 202 236 239 9.99 20.29 16.8% 1.39 444 49 507 11.49 13.49 430 479 454 575 1.99 -9.0% Rx Drugs and NonDurMe 435 464 365 294 311 279 314 473 50.69 6.75 21.39 19.5% 5.89 10.39 12.5% 8 Durable Medical Prod 19 169 161 159 149 146 158 141 7.09 -4.79-1.2% -6.39 0.09 6.0% -10.89 Nursing Home Care 1.046 1.020 993 936 861 917 913 690 -2.59 -2.69 5.7% -8.09 6.59 -0.496-24.49 10 Other Healthcare 1,292 1,350 1,331 1,233 1,192 1,328 1,267 842 4.59 -1.49-7.4%-3.3% 11.4% -4.6%-33.5% Enrollees (k) 413 430 551 591 610 617 845 4.1% 14.0% 12.4% 7.3% 37.09 11 Population (k) 490 1.1% Total Exp (\$m) Personal Health Care 2.849 3.059 3.415 3.952 4,595 4.937 6.038 7.59 9.59 22.3 Hospital Care 1,014 1,101 1,202 1,669 1,780 1,976 2.119 2,460 8.6% 9.2% 38.9% 6.79 11.0% 7.2% 16.19 1.3% 49.09 Physician & ClinCare 376 473 479 538 590 9.7% 22.4% 384 722 1,076 2.19 23.2% 12.39 3 Other Prof Services HDIV/0 /DIV/0 #DIV/O 6 77 105 116 125 123 146 202 14.9 36.49 789 18.7% 38.4 10.5% -1.68 Home Health Care 17 206 239 245 269 276 313 486 15.79 16.09 2.5% 9.89 2.69 13.4% 55.39 Rx Drues and NonDurMee 180 200 179 162 184 170 194 400 11.19 -10.59 -9.5% 13.69 -7.69 14.1% 106.29 7.7% Durable Medical Prod Œ 73 119 3,4% 21.49 79 91 98 12.39 8.2% 11,4% 0.09 43 515 509 599 0.9% Nursing Home Care 1.69 6.0% 9.89 3,4 10 Other Healthcare 533 581 652 679 704 810 782 712 9.09 12.2% 4.1% 3.79 15.1% -3.5% -9.09 \$ Per Enrollee 1 Personal Health Care 8.075 8.712 9.064 8,978 0.8% 8,383 8.877 8,990 9.287 3.89 3.99 -0.9%3,728 3,658 3,777 3,851 3,872 3,833 3,881 1.99 2.0% 0.59 0.09 Hospital Care 3,872 1.39 -1.0%1.3 Physician & ClinCare 2,030 2,070 2.194 2,233 2.264 2,354 2,403 2.09 26 Δ Other Prof Service 270 297 311 330 339 3.49 5 Dental Services 11 25.09 120,09 36,4% 0.09 14.39 -12.5% 14.39 Home Health Care 44 488 548 587 595 561 544 8.79 12.39 7.1% 0.29 1.29 -5.7% -3.09 Rx Drugs and NonDurMed 1,309 89 1,036 1,049 1,070 1,081 1,096 9.7 2.05 6.191.09 19.49 Durable Medical Prod 216 257 243 236 231 237 227 225 19.09 -2.9% -2.19 2.69 -4.2% -0.99 Nursing Home Care 514 562 532 508 4.39 3.1% -10.19 10 Other Healthcare 92 55 55 54 55 5 54 53 5.8% 0.0% -1.8% 1.99 0.0% -1.8% -1.9% Enrollees (k) 11 Population (k) 59 579 602 625 650 686 755 3.8% 4.09 3.8% 4.09 5.89 4.9% 4.69 Total Exp (\$m) ersonal Health Care 4,508 4,857 5,245 5,547 5,84 6,239 6,484 7,013 8.09 6.89 8.29 2,274 2,665 Hospital Care 2,042 2,406 2,160 2,519 2.768 2,931 5.89 3.9% 5.99 Physician & ClinCare 1,133 1.199 1.321 1.471 1,621 1,690 1.815 5.89 7.49 4 Other Prof Services 14 156 181 202 22 270 6.89 16.09 2.8% 8.69 12,49 10.2 Dental Services 50.09 133,3% -28.6% 20.09 25 283 330 367 410 405 411 12.7 382 16.69 4.19 7.39 -1.29 1.5 49 744 Rx Drugs and NonDurMed 624 655 695 Durable Medical Prod 121 146 150 168 170 23.19 8.7% Nursing Home Care 280 310 328 351 385 366 377 383 8.09 5.89 7.0% 9.79 -4.9% 3.0% 1.6% 10 Other Healthcare 32 33 38 39 10.3% 3.1% 0.0% 9.19 2.6% 2.6% \$ Per Enro 1 Personal Health Care 3.276 3.515 3.721 3,593 4.037 4,091 4,379 4,623 7.39 5.9% -3.4% 12.49 1.3% 7.0% 5.69 Enrollees (k) 11 Population (k) 3,359 3,331 3,285 3,227 3,230 3,266 3,307 3,388 -0.8% -1.4%-1.8%0.1% 1.1% 1.3% 2.4% 1 Personal Health Care 13,365 14,480 15,662 6.4% 12,222 11,595 13,037

RWJF and University of Wisconsin, County Health Rankings 2015r

 2015R percentiles of all counties reporting in the USA (n = 3141)

 State
 Colorado

 County
 Denver

Example Pivot Table, County Health Rankings
Pivot Table Library/Repository of Healthcare Data
uTube: Pivot Tables YouTube: PowerPivot

Denver County, Colorado

Overall Health Equity GPA (5 = 100%)>> 2.4 Values 48% 60 Prefhib 60 Ptl Median 20Pt Min Max 80 Pt 40 Ptl Total Counties in State Average of Summary, Health Outcomes: Rank Average of Summary, Health Factors: Rank 40 48 Outcomes GPA >> Health Factors GPA >> Average of Summary, Environment: Rank 44 52 En vironment GPA >> Average of Summary, Socio-Economics: Rank Socio-Economics GPA >> Health Behaviors GPA >> 49 Average of Summary, Health Behaviors: Rank 13 37 Clinical Care GPA >> Average of Summary, Clinical Care: Rank 3.8 Average of Summary, Quality of Life: Rank Average of Summary, Length of Life: Rank 3,462 Sum of Pop: Total 649,495 162,829 11,408 6,085 4,206 2,334 761 Average of Pop: % Female 49.8 49.2 48.7 47.7 45.3 Average of Pop: % Under 18 21.0 37.4 23.1 22.1 21.9 20.9 20.2 15.7 Average of Pop: % 65 plus 21.0 10.7 32.2 24.4 18.8 14.2 7.4 19.8 Average of Pop: % Afro American 9.3 3.4 0.5 2.0 3.8 Average of Pop: % American Indian 82.0 0.4 1.7 1.1 0.7 0.4 Average of Pop: % Asian 0.3 2.4 0.3 0.2 Average of Pop: % Native Pacific 0.0 Average of Pop: % Hispan 30.9 10.8 3.1 2.4 2.0 1.9 1.2 0.7 Average of Pop: % White Non Hispanic 53.4 98.0 95.8 94.1 93.7 931 88.2 142 Average of Pop: % Not English Proficient 0.5 0.3 6.7 1.2 0.2 0.2 0.0 Average of Pop: % Rural 100.0 100.0 10.4 100.0 100.0 100.0 Average of Outcomes: % Diabetic Prevalence 6.3 lo 13.9 11.0 10.5 10.3 9.8 9.1 6.2 Average of Outcomes: HIV Prevalence 100k 1223 lo Average of Outcomes: Age-Adjusted Mortality Average of Outcomes: Infant Mortality Rate 1000 361 834.5 381.0 331.6 314.2 302.3 270.3 231.9 ю 9.3 8.9 13.5 6.3 5.3 4.6 lo Average of Outcomes: Child Mortality per 1000 64.8 lo 253.4 184.7 72.3 71.2 641 49.7 464 17.3 Average of Behaviors: Food Insecurity-6.2 lo 6.4 Average of Behaviors: Healthy Food Limited - % 39.9 26.1 14.6 9.3 lo Average of Behaviors: Children Elig Free Lunch % 58.9 83.7 30.6 28.2 28.2 22.9 19.4 lo Average of Behaviors: Homicide Rate 7.3 lo 2.3 2.2 2.1 2.0 1.9 1.8 1.7 Average of Behaviors: MV Crash Mortality Rate 68.4 lo 18.8 6.9 Average of Behaviors: Drug Poisoning Mortality 100k 25.3 8.3 6.6 5.4 5.3 4.7 4.2 lo 5.1 Average of Care Access: Median Household Income \$51.158 hi 84.237.0 82 715 0 58 354 8 543120 2 944 4 875.2 34 49 1 0 Average of Care Access: Uninsured, % 12.4 lo Average of Care Access: Uninsured Adult 18+ % 26.1 15.5 13.7 18.1 14.5 ю Average of Care Access: Uninsured Under 18 % 9.4 lo 18.5 10.9 9.5 9.1 2.5 8.9 5.6 Average of Care Access: Health Cost per Capita \$8,810 11.125.0 8.053.8 7.806.2 7.236.9 6.137.7 ю 8.716.3 8.313.1 Average of Care Access: Limited by Cost - % 15 F 16.1 6.6 6.3 lo Average of Health Outcomes: YPLL <75 per 100k 7.151 23 880 1 8 578 5 7.248.5 081.1 8 389 6 5 4 1 1 5 4001 Average of Health Outcomes: FairPoor Health % 16.4 lo 26.8 13.6 12.2 11.6 10.8 9.6 5.4 Average of Health Outcomes: Poor Phys Health, Days/30 3.2 lo 4.5 3.0 2.7 2.6 2.6 2.0 12 Average of Health Outcomes: Poor Mental Health, Days/30 ю 9.2 Average of Health Outcomes: Low BirthWgt, LBW % lo 9.4 8.1 8.5 6.3 6.0 5.5 3.6 Average of Health Behaviors: Adult Obesity BMI 30, % lo 40.0 32.4 30.9 30.6 30.1 28.7 26.6 Average of Health Behaviors:Food Environment Index 16.2 Average of Health Behaviors: Adult Smoking, 19.5 44.3 23.7 18.4 17.4 14.3 8.3 31.4 35.1 Average of Health Behaviors: Physically Inactive % 13.8 lo 30.0 29.1 26.3 19.9 Average of Health Behaviors: With Access to Exercise 84.9 43.5 99 Average of Health Behaviors:Excessive Drinking, 26.1 22.0 35.9 23.3 21.9 20.6 19.1 13.9 Average of Health Behaviors:Driving Deaths, DUI % 38.9 lo 100.0 66.7 50.0 50.0 40.6 27.8 4 Average of Health Behaviors:STD, Chlamydia, Rate 100k 862 1 501 9 4442 339.2 313.0 194.8 1414 550 Average of Health Behaviors:Teen Birth Rate 1000 21.2 19.4 12.4 lo Average of Clinical Care: PCP Rate, Primary Care Average of Clinical Care: PCP Ratio, Primary Care 117.3 476.0 88.0 55.1 24.3 lo #NUM! #NUM #NUM! #NUM! #NUM! 124.8 Average of Clinical Care: Dentist, Rate 1000 65.3 45.1 41.8 31.9 Average of Clinical Care: Dentist, Rati #NUM #NUM #NUM! #NUM #NUM! Average of Clinical Care: MHP Rate, Mental Health 404.0 438.8 230.5 77.8 70.2 414 23.6 5 Average of Clinical Care: MHP Ratio, Mental Health #NUM! #NUM #NUM #NUM #NUM! lo 90.4 285.8 86.9 Average of Care Access: Other Primary, Rate 1000 133.8 76.7 59.8 Average of Care Access: Other Primary, PCP Ratio #NUM! #NUM #NUM! #NUM! #NUM! 5 Average of Clinical Care: Pre v Hosp Stays, Rate/1000 37.4 lo 123.7 82.2 88.2 80.1 58.2 49.4 412 Average of Clinical Care: % Diabetics Recd HbA1c 100.0 92.4 83.9 29.3 72.2 Average of Clinical Care: Mammo Screening, Medicare % 61.8 78.9 69.2 67.8 66.8 60.7 44.7 Average of Socio-Economic: HS Graduation Rate % 53 B hi 95.9 91.3 87.3 86.9 857 81.6 654 75.1 68.2 63.0 52.5 Average of Socio-Economiα Some College, % 81.6 hi Average of Socio-Economic: Unemployment, 12.9 4.6 3.5 3.1 2.9 0.9 ю Average of Socio-Economic: Child Poverty, % FPL < 1 28.7 lo 43.0 15.2 5.0 13.1 12.2 11.5 9.5 6.8 Average of Socio-Economic: Income 80/20 Ratio 4.3 lo 4.5 4.3 4.0 3.6 Average of Socio-Economic: Social Assocn s Rate per 10k 10.5 59.3 32.6 25.5 19.9 13.1 22.1 Average of Socio-Economic: Single Parent House Hold % 38.6 62.2 27.5 23.3 21.0 19.5 14.7 22 332.3 185.8 178.8 115.1 87.5 91.0 53.9 76.0 Average of Socio-Economic: Violent Crimes Rate 100k 598.2 64.1 25.1 59.4 38.8 Average of Socio-Economic: Deaths by Injury, Rate 84.4 84.5 lo Average of En vironment Air Pollution, Particles PM2.5 9.8 9.8 lo Average of En vironment Severe Housing Proble 21.0 lo 22.5 10.7 9.6 8.5 7.9 6.5 52 69.6 82.8 79.1 75.5 549 71.6 63.8 Average of En vironment Driving Alone to Work % lo 74.4 Average of En vironment Long Commute Alone % 22.6 26.4 13.1 19.0 17.4 8.1 lo Average of En vironment Drinking Water Violations % 0.0 to 55.0 Average of En vironment Drinking Water Violations % 0.0 to 55.0 En vironme 2.2